

Annex 3 - 'Better Decision Making' Evaluation



'Better Decision Making' Tool
 Informing our approach to sustainability,
 resilience and fairness

The 'Better Decision Making' tool has been designed to help you consider the impact of your proposal on the health and wellbeing of communities, the environment, and local economy. It draws upon the priorities set out in our Council Plan and will help us to provide inclusive and discrimination-free services by considering the equalities and human rights implications of the decisions we make. The purpose of this tool is to avoid decisions being made in isolation, and to encourage evidence-based decision making that carefully balances social, economic and environmental factors, helping us to become a more responsive and resilient organisation.

The Better Decision Making tool should be used when proposing new projects, services, policies or strategies, or significant amendments to them. The tool should be completed at the earliest opportunity, ideally when you are just beginning to develop a proposal. However, it can be completed at any stage of the decision-making process. If the tool is completed just prior to the Executive, it can still help to guide future courses of action as the proposal is implemented.

Introduction

Service submitting the proposal:	Bootham Park Hospital Project
Name of person completing the assessment:	Tracey Carter
Job title:	Assistant Director of Regeneration and Asset Management
Directorate:	Economy and Place
Date Completed:	6th January 2020
Date Approved:	9th January 2020

Section 1: What is the proposal?

	Name of the service, project, programme, policy or strategy being assessed?
1.1	Shaping the Future of Bootham Park Hospital.

	What are the main aims of the proposal?
1.2	Leverage of the options available to the Council to help it shape the future of the Bootham Park Hospital site ("the Site"), guided by extensive public and stakeholder engagement.

	What are the key outcomes?
1.3	<p>a. preservation and public, sports and active leisure use of the Parkland in front of the hospital buildings;</p> <p>b. continuation and enhancement of pedestrian and cycle routes across the Site from Bootham to Clarence Street and onto the District Hospital Site at Bridge Lane;</p> <p>c. achieving a sustainable and desirable use of the historic buildings, ideally one that gives life to its historic care and mental health uses by, for example, providing accommodation with care for older people including those living with dementia; and</p> <p>d. delivering value to neighbouring landowners City of York Council and Hospital Trust by way of purchase of land or rights to ease access to the Bootham Site and to enable the development of care, medical facilities and key worker accommodation on the Bootham Court land [owned by the District Hospital Trust].</p>

Section 2: Evidence

	What data / evidence is available to support the proposal and understand its likely impact? (e.g. hate crime figures, obesity levels, recycling statistics)
2.1	<p>Local schools experience a shortage of outdoor curriculum space. Better recreation and healthy lifestyle use of the Parkland on the Site is a "once in a generation" opportunity. Cycle and pedestrian routes across the Site are at risk should development seek to close them, limiting sustainable transport options for citizens.</p> <p>Poor air quality in the area could be made worse by poor development decisions.</p> <p>Grade 1 and Grade 2 listed buildings are located on the Site and their historical and other significance is at risk by mis-focused development.</p> <p>A full Health Impact Assessment has been undertaken for this Site by the Clinical Commissioning Group (one of the first for York) and this is available on line at www.york.gov.uk/info/20048/major_developments/2247/bootham_park_site.</p>

	What public / stakeholder consultation has been undertaken and what were the findings?
2.2	<p>In the winter of 2018/9 the Council worked with the York Teaching Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust (owner of the adjoining District Hospital site) to draw up a Site Development Plan for the Site and adjacent publically owned land (“the Development Plan”). This plan was devised following extensive public and stakeholder engagement. In the autumn of 2019 a further engagement exercise on the Development Plan was undertaken. During this engagement we sought views on the published plan and asked people to prioritise their preferences for the Site. The engagement exercise reached 1328 people and generated 1570 items of feedback. All aspects of the plan attracted at least 70% approval.</p> <p>People’s highest priorities for development on the Site are:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • maintaining and ensuring access to public green spaces; • providing Key worker accommodation; • preserving listed buildings; and • creating better cycling and pedestrian links.

	Are there any other initiatives that may produce a combined impact with this proposal? (e.g. will the same individuals / communities of identity also be impacted by a different project or policy?)
2.3	<p>The same communities will be affected by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • proposed developments at Bootham Crescent and on the Duncombe Barracks site; • the on-going modernisation and re-development of the York Teaching Hospital site; and • regeneration plans and proposals in the Groves area.

Section 3: Impact on One Planet principles

Equity and Local Economy

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.1	Impact positively on the business community in York?	Positive	Gillygate Traders and York BID have been engaged in commenting on proposals for the Site and they support plans to improve public access to and use of the Bootham Parkland as they see this a adding to the "offer" that the Fifth Quarter can make to the economy of York.
3.2	Provide additional employment or training opportunities in the city?	Positive	Employment and training outcomes will be enhanced by delivering a mixed use of this site, particularly the provision of care services for older people and accommodation for medical training and other services which would benefit the York District Hospital next door.

3.3	Help improve the lives of individuals from disadvantaged backgrounds or underrepresented groups?	Positive	Should our ambition to see Extra Care accommodation for older people be delivered on this site, it will provide good care and housing for older and vulnerable people including those living with dementia.
-----	---	----------	---

Health & Happiness

Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.4	Improve the physical health or emotional wellbeing of residents or staff?	Positive By making positive and active use of the Parkland on the Site, for both structured sport and active leisure, we have the potential to improve the physical health and emotional wellbeing of local school children and residents. Should Extra Care accommodation for older people be delivered on the site, we help to improve the emotional wellbeing of older citizens including those living with dementia.
3.5	Help reduce health inequalities?	Positive Delivery of dementia care services of the site will help to address a shortfall of provision. Should medical training facilities be achieved on site it will help to increase the number of qualified doctors and nurses that can be training in York.
3.6	Encourage residents to be more responsible for their own health?	Positive The provision for structured sport and active leisure opportunities will give residents the opportunity to take more responsibility for their own health.
3.7	Reduce crime or fear of crime?	Positive The Parkland can currently be mis-used and this gives rise to fear of crime. By making the space more active and used, misuse and the resultant fear of crime will reduce. The cycle and pedestrian route through the site should benefit from improved lighting and use, thereby mitigating fear of crime by people using a poorly lit route at night.
3.8	Help to give children and young people a good start in life?	Positive The ambition to utilise the Parkland to help meet the shortfall in outdoor curriculum space at local schools will ensure that children and young people can benefit from sport, active leisure and access to green spaces, helping to give them a good start in life.

Culture & Community

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.9	Help bring communities together?	Positive	The multiple uses proposed for the Site will help to increase the diversity of people of use and access the Site and, thereby, will help to bring communities together.
3.10	Improve access to services for residents, especially those most in need?	Positive	Physical access to and through the site, via level and better pedestrian and cycle routes and even an improvement to Glass Bridge, will help improve access for residents, especial those most in need. The provision of services for people living with dementia will help those most vulnerable older people.
3.11	Improve the cultural offerings of York?	Positive	A sensitive preservation and re-use of the historic buildings, ideally with opportunities for public access to their most significant features, will add significantly to York's already impressive cultural offer. Places in a public parkland which can be animated by sport and active leisure, the Firth Quarter has the potential to become a destination for visitor and residents alike.
3.12	Encourage residents to be more socially responsible?	Mixed	By promoting a mixed use for the Site and one with extensive public access, the various users (such as private property owners, care home residents and medical students) will be encouraged to mix and engage with the wider uses. However, the challenge, will be to achieve acceptance by new residents and existing neighbours that mixed use and different uses are beneficial and should be encouraged.

Zero Carbon and Sustainable Water

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.13	Minimise the amount of energy we use and / or reduce the amount of energy we pay for?	Mixed	New development on the Site can be built to good levels of thermal efficiency, thereby minimising energy use. However, the many Listed and historic building on the Site will limit the capacity for significant thermal improvements to these structures. The generation of power on the site will be limited by historic building conservation and preservation factors but may be possible via photo voltaic generation on the roofs of new build structures.
3.14	Minimise the amount of water we use and/or reduce the amount of water we pay for?	Positive	The refurbishment of historic buildings and the construction of new will allow for the installation of low water consumption plumbing fittings, helping to minimise water use.

Zero Waste

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.15	Reduce waste and the amount of money we pay to dispose of waste by maximising reuse and/or recycling of materials?	Positive	The refurbishment of historic buildings and the construction of new will allow for the design of and installation of waste minimisation and waste recycling facilities.

Sustainable Transport

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.16	Encourage the use of sustainable transport, such as walking, cycling, ultra low emission vehicles and public transport?	Positive	A key priority for this project is to secure improved walking and cycling routes through the Bootham Hospital Site, both south to north and west to east. In addition, improvements may be achieved to bus links to the District Hospital,
3.17	Help improve the quality of the air we breathe?	Positive	The area around the Site includes experiences low air quality and, therefore, sustainable transport and changes to vehicle movements are sought. A priority would be to close the Bootham entrance to the site to vehicle traffic, taking cars off of the already very busy Bootham.

Sustainable Materials

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.18	Minimise the environmental impact of the goods and services used?	Mixed	Imaginative use of the Parkland and good management of the site overall will help to promote the use of sustainable material and services; such initiatives should be sought as part of the developer's Impact Assessment. However, the Site's and its many development constraints means that the use of sustainable materials during the works may be constrained on cost and viability grounds.

Local and Sustainable Food

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.19	Maximise opportunities to support local and sustainable food initiatives?	Positive	There is extensive open space on the site and a history of fruit and vegetable growing and, therefore, the replication of provision as part of the new development should be encouraged.

Land Use and Wildlife

	Does your proposal?	Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
3.20	Maximise opportunities to conserve or enhance the natural environment?	Positive	A key priority of the ambitions for the Site is to see the Parkland preserved and put to good use, both for sport and active leisure but also as a significant haven for flora and fauna in the city centre.
3.21	Improve the quality of the built environment?	Positive	The Site already host to prime buildings and a very high quality built environment. The our plans seek to preserve this and, at the same time, see the adjacent areas (such as Bootham Court and the Union Terrace car park) improved in terms of quality of use, buildings and environment.

3.22	Preserve the character and setting of the historic city of York?	Positive	The Bootham Hospital Site is a prominent feature in to historic landscape of York, not only because of the quality of the buildings and the long history of mental health use, but also because of the city-centre Parkland setting. It is the preservation and use of this Parkland setting which is a priority of the Council's ambitions.
3.23	Enable residents to enjoy public spaces?	Positive	Our priory is to see positive and active use made of the Parkland on the Site, for both structured sport and active leisure.

Section 4: Impact on Equalities and Human Rights

Equalities

Will the proposal **adversely impact** upon 'communities of identity'?
 Will it **help advance equality** or **foster good relations** between people in 'communities of identity'?

		Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
4.1	Age	Positive	Should we achieve the provision of Extra Care accommodation for older people on the Site which will deliver good quality accommodation with care, including for those living with dementia, leading to improved health and social outcomes.
4.2	Disability	Positive	Should we achieve the desired outcomes on the site, we will see an improvements in care services for disabled older people, physiotherapy services for all age groups and accessibility for those with mobility problems who need to use Glass Bridge.
4.3	Gender	Positive	Improved care provision for older people will disproportionately benefit women because they form a larger proportion of the elderly population, helping them to overcome disadvantage in care opportunities and social interaction.
4.4	Gender Reassignment	Positive	By encouraging the creation of inclusive spaces and services - including care services - we work to overcome disadvantage experienced by people who have undergone gender reassignment.
4.5	Marriage and civil partnership	Positive	The location of the Bootham Parkland directly opposite the York Registry Office, means that the open space can be used by

			those celebrating their marriage or civil partnership.
4.6	Pregnancy and maternity	Positive	Should the ambition to see improved medical services, including medical training, be achieved on this Site then the wider services delivered at the District Hospital will benefit, including the range of services delivered to support pregnancy and maternity.
4.7	Race	Positive	By encouraging the creation of inclusive spaces and services - including care services - we work to overcome disadvantage and discrimination experienced by people of the BAEM communities.
4.8	Religion or belief	Positive	Proposed uses of the Parkland including proposals for "contemplation spaces", both to honour the site's long term association with mental health but also to allow spiritual engagement by all faiths, and those with none.
4.9	Sexual orientation	Positive	By encouraging the creation of inclusive spaces and services - including care services - we work to overcome disadvantage experienced by people because of their sexual orientation.
4.10	Carer	Positive	Should we achieve the provision of Extra Care accommodation for older people on the Site, including care for those living with dementia, we know that this provision will also benefit carers.
4.11	Lowest income groups	Positive	The provision of open spaces in the city centre which can be enjoyed by all, and the opportunity to deliver affordable housing on the site (subject to development viability of the historic buildings), will be of benefit to the lowest income groups. Should other public land, such as Union Terrace car park, be brought into use for multiple uses such as parking and housing, greater provision of affordable housing could be achieved.
4.12	Veterans, Armed forces community	Positive	The range of initiatives and services proposed for the site will benefit veterans and the armed forces community as they will also benefit the wider community.

Human Rights

Consider how a human rights approach is evident in the proposal

		Impact	What are the impacts and how do you know?
4.13	Right to education	Positive	Our ambition to see the Parkland on the Site used for structured sport and active leisure use will help address a shortfall of outdoor curriculum space in local schools. Improvements to medical training facilities will help with both quality and access to these education opportunities.
4.14	Right not to be subjected to torture, degrading treatment or punishment	Positive	The Site has a long and at times controversial history both for the pioneering of innovation in the care of those with mental health needs but also for mistreatment and degrading treatment. We would urge that space on the site is set aside to help all understand the past history of the site, to help people remember and to contemplate and also to act as a reminder that degrading treatment in health care is not acceptable in a civilised society.
4.15	Right to a fair and public hearing	Positive	Any development proposal for the site will be the subject to a full planning process including public consultation and the right for comment to be submitted and heard as part of the planning deliberation.
4.16	Right to respect for private and family life, home and correspondence	Positive	A priority for the Site will be to see the development of independent living opportunities for older people where privacy and a home environment is preserved while quality care is delivered on site.
4.17	Freedom of expression	Positive	The development of the proposals for the Site has already been the subject of extensive public engagement where people have been free to express their view. More consultation will be prompted by formal planning proposals which will follow. By encouraging the creation of inclusive spaces and services - including care services - we would expect all users to enjoy freedom of expression while also respecting other rights and responsibilities.
4.18	Right not to be subject to discrimination	Positive	By encouraging the creation of inclusive spaces and services - including care services - we would expect all users to be free from discrimination in their use of spaces and services.

4.19	Other Rights	Positive	By encouraging the creation of inclusive spaces and services - including care services - we would expect other rights to be honoured.
------	---------------------	----------	---

Section 5: Planning for Improvement

5.1	<p>What have you changed in order to improve the impact of the proposal on the One Planet principles? (please consider the questions you marked either mixed or negative, as well as any additional positive impacts that may be achievable)</p>
	<p>Via feedback from public engagement we have amended the Council's ambitions for the site to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - understanding the vision for the Parkland at the Site as part of the wider vision for the Fifth Quarter with benefits to Gillygate and Bootham trade; - consideration of the submission of a Public Right of Way application and/or a Town or Village Green application for the Site; and - raising the ambition for a Land Trust or Community Asset Management organisation who would work to expand inclusion in the use of the Site and its socially responsible uses.

5.2	<p>What have you changed in order to improve the impact of the proposal on equalities and human rights? (please consider the questions you marked either mixed or negative, as well as any additional positive impacts that may be achievable)</p>
	<p>Via feedback from public engagement we have amended the Council's ambitions for the site to include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - the provision of "contemplation space" in the open areas of the site in order to allow visitors to contemplate the previous uses of the Site for mental health care; and - an examination of a re-design and re-provision of Glass Bridge in order to improve uses for those with mobility difficulties and cyclists.

5.3	<p>Going forward, what further evidence or consultation is needed to ensure the proposal delivers its intended benefits? e.g. consultation with specific vulnerable groups, additional data)</p>
	<p>Further consultation will drive the ambition for the Community Asset Management organisation or Land Trust to shape and manage the use of the Parkland of the site. As a minimum, local schools should be invited to take a key governance role in this. The formal planning applications which will be needed to drive forward the development of the site will include extensive consultation, as determined by legislation.</p>

5.4	<p>Please record any outstanding actions needed to maximise benefits or minimise negative impacts in relation to this proposal? (Expand / insert more rows if needed)</p>
-----	--

Action	Person(s)	Due date
Engagement with the potential purchaser/s of the site to promote the ambition for the Site and help shape their plans.	Property and Regeneration team	2020
Engagement with potential partners in a Community Asset Management organisation or Land Trust for the site in order to help shape the future uses of the Parkland.	Regeneration team, local schools, Fifth Quarter representatives and others.	2020/2021
Consideration of the Bootham Site traffic and Transport ambitions as part of the new Traffic and Transport Plan which is planned.	Traffic and Transport team	2020
Consideration of planning, heritage, housing and transport issues in the context of the NPPF and the Local Plan designation of the site.	Planning, transport and development teams	2020/21